

## Proposal Evaluation Summary

### Design Services for Kirkwood Roundabout – RFP #PUR0516-200

Proposals opened July 7, 2016

Evaluators: Kevin Vrchoticky, Nate Kampman, John Witt, Matt Myers

#### Proposals received in alphabetical order:

Firm Name	Location
Ament Design	Cedar Rapids, IA
Anderson Bogert	Cedar Rapids, IA
Bolton & Menk, Inc.	Ames, IA
Hall & Hall Engineers, Inc.	Hiawatha, IA
hbk Engineering	Cedar Rapids, IA
McClure Engineering Co.	North Liberty, IA
Snyder & Associates	Cedar Rapids, IA
YTT Design Solutions	Cedar Rapids, IA

#### Top four ranked firms:

##### 1. Bolton & Menk, Inc.

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience	540
Proposed Cost (see page 2)	170
Responsiveness	150
Local Preference Points	n/a
Total Evaluation Points	860

#### Facts:

- Firm possesses all required experience in-house with no need for sub-consultants
- Extensive experience on roundabout projects, including some for schools
- Proposal clearly presents specific roundabout experience of the individual team members who would be assigned to this project
- Financial proposal is within competitive range
- Clear understanding of project with very detailed timeline and proven success on multiple roundabout projects

##### 2. Snyder & Associates

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience	480
Proposed Cost (see page 2)	160
Responsiveness	160
Local Preference Points	50
Total Evaluation Points	850

#### Facts:

- Local branch of large firm possessing all required experience in-house with no need for sub-consultants
- Firm has extensive roundabout experience, including for schools, and good experience on landscape architecture and lighting
- Roundabout experience is not specifically tied to the individual project team members presented in the proposal
- Financial proposal is within competitive range
- Clear understanding of project and reasonable timeline

### 3. Anderson Bogert

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience	420
Proposed Cost (see page 2)	180
Responsiveness	140
Local Preference Points	50
Total Evaluation Points	790

#### Facts:

- Local firm teamed with sub-consultants Confluence, Design Engineers, and Terracon
- Extensive experience working on many City projects
- Firm has some roundabout experience
- Financial proposal is within competitive range
- Clear understanding of project and reasonable timeline

### 4. Hall & Hall Engineers, Inc.

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience	480
Proposed Cost (see page 2)	120
Responsiveness	140
Local Preference Points	50
Total Evaluation Points	790

#### Facts:

- Local firm teamed with sub-consultant Kittelson & Associates, a leader in roundabout design
- Currently working with the City on several Paving for Progress projects
- Majority of team experience with roundabouts is with sub-consultant, Kittelson & Associates, who will be reviewing the plans for this project on behalf of the DOT for any consultant who is awarded this project.
- Financial proposal is at high end of competitive range
- Clear understanding of project and detailed timeline; sub-consultant has proven success on multiple roundabout projects

#### **Recommendation for Award:**

The evaluation team scored the top ranked proposals and Bolton & Menk, Inc. was rated as the top proposal. A resolution will be presented to the City Council on July 26, 2016 recommending that the contract be awarded to Bolton & Menk.

#### **Financial Submittals:**

Firm	Financial Proposal
Ament Design	\$169,084
Anderson Bogert	\$132,000
Bolton & Menk, Inc.	\$137,914
Hall & Hall Engineers, Inc.	\$178,880
hbk Engineering	\$113,190
McClure Engineering Co.	\$275,533
Snyder & Associates	\$142,940
YTT Design Solutions	\$95,088